Skills and Human Resources Development in Improving Employee Performance

Nurhaeda Zaeni1*, Shandra Bahasoan2, Haeranah
1,2* STIE Nobel Indonesia Makassar, Jl. Sultan Alauddin, No 212, Makassar, South Sulawesi, 90231

ARTICLE INFO

Correspondence Email: nurhaedazaeni@stienobel-indonesia.ac.id

Keywords:
Skills; HR Development; Performance

DOI: https://doi.org/10.33096/jmb.v8i1.669

ABSTRACT

This study aims to test the influence of Skill and human resource development on the performance of Civil Servants at the Cultural Heritage Preservation Center of South Sulawesi. The data used questionnaires that were distributed to respondents. The data collected using the list of questions (indicators) submitted as a measuring instrument using modification of the likert scale. The sample of this study was a group of employees at the South Sulawesi Cultural Heritage Preservation Center of 100 respondents. Where all employees have different characteristics from high school education level to master (S2) and based on work experience. Data analysis was conducted qualitatively and quantitatively using multiple linear regression methods. This method is used when conducting analysis on the influence of Skill and Human Resource Development on the Performance of Civil Servants at the Cultural Heritage Preservation Center of South Sulawesi. The result show that skill and development of human resources have a positive and significant effect on employee performance and, should routinely provide that Skill to its employees and has more attention to the performance of its employees. Employees who are considered to be under-performing, it is best to develop the employee.

INTRODUCTION

Nowadays, the latest developments recognize human resources not as mere resources, but rather as capital or assets for an organization or company, therefore known as a term outside human resources or human capital. The effectiveness of the Organization is largely determined by the quality of the workers who come here already. Accelerated changing climate demands that they be capable of capturing the phenomenon of transformation, analyze its impact on the organization and make preparations steps to handle this situation. Responding to this actuality, the role of human resource management in the Organization is not only administrative, but also more focused on how the Organization is able to develop its human resource potential in order to be creative and innovative.

Therefore, all situations that include human resources in an organization must be an important concern for the management of an organization, with the existence of qualified and highly committed human resource department which will significantly raise the productivity of an organization. The productivity shown through human resources in the organization would also take a significant role in the development of the organization in the future, even though productivity is a measurement of success or failure to achieve the goals of the organization as well as an indicates of comparing the results of the work with the standards established by the management or corporation. Therefore, the performance of human resources used by an organization must be continuously developed by conducting various evaluations on these human resources. Many ways that can be done in improving the performance of human resources include creating a conducive work environment, high work discipline, a motivating compensation system, as well as Skill and development to human resources in an organization will be very helpful in achieving the performance of human resources whose productivity is
needed in an organization to achieve its goals. As its effectiveness of the Organization is highly affected by the performance of its employees.

According to Wirawan (2009) Performance is the output produced by functions or indicators of job’s profession in a certain time. At this point, it is explained that the performance can be a guideline in their profession. Performance has a caesal relationship with competence. Performance is a function of competence, attitude and action so that the role of human resources is very important in a government organization, both private companies and government companies, in order to get a good human resources workforce and appropriate Skill development is very necessary. This is an attempt to educate the employees for roles that have not yet been controlled. Management of Taylor believed that workers needed proper skills. This principle is rather sufficient in important to maintain that the job is performed as swiftly as possible in the capacity and obligation to work. The ability to work, build and enhance their performance through knowledge and improvement.

A skill program and the management of human capital must be in operation. Both competence and intense competition are required in each area in an institution, particularly organizations, corporations or government agencies. The skills program and the improvement of human development (KR) must be enforced to strengthen work ethics and capability in the organisation, recognizing the number of staff and public officials still lacking appropriate experience, skill and knowledge. Sjafri Mangkuprawira said, “Skill for employees is a process of teaching certain knowledge and skills and attitudes so that employees are more skilled and able to carry out their responsibilities better.

Skills and development are also highly necessary for employees and organizations (Devi & Shaik, 2012). Well-organized and important employee development and training systems are closely aligned with long-term strategies for performance and change. Effectiveness is Capability and Development’s resulting outcomes. Employee integrity was seen as an essential way to preserve the productivity of the organization.

Skill at the beginning of the work aims to improve the competencies that must be possessed by staff, which is a requirement set by the company. Advanced skills aim to increase skills to a higher level of competence or transition as innovative company need to be managed or new abilities if they go to work (Wirawan, 2009). Skill not only affects productivity and effectiveness but is expected to benefit from the expertise of the organization to enhance the workforce’s output. Skill is also an activity that provides participants with the expertise required for their current work (Mondy, 2008). The purpose of implementing employee abilities and knowledge being (Kaswan, 2013). Furthermore, skills can involve shifting behaviors so that workers can work more efficiently.

Gomes (2003:197) Skill is any attempt to improve the performance of workers in a particular job that is being responsibilited for, or one job that has to do with his work. According to Simamora, 2009 stated that the Skill was directed to help employees do their current jobs better, while development represents a future-oriented investment in employees. After Skill there is one more variable that can affect an employee's performance, namely development. HR Development is also a process by which employees are skilled and experienced to succeed in current jobs and future tasks (Kaswan, 2013). Development is learning to help employee growth, improve employee performance in their work to improve employee position in the future (Tjeng, et.al, 2013). Because human resource development is related to the availability of learning opportunities and development, create Skill programs that include planning, organizing, and evaluating the program (Armstrong, 2010:504).

Know-how and human resources growth are very important because they are both ways of sustaining, enhancing and maintaining the public workforce of the company and improving the capacities of workers to improve productivity in that sector. The main purpose of this skill and development is to resolve the weaknesses in the workforce triggered by potential incompetence in carrying out work while simultaneously attempting to develop more efficient
human resources. This was identified that employee’s performance is significant influenced by Skill and Human Resource Development.

This phenomenon is continuing also in other institutions like the government department which, as planned, are developing skills and human resources one direction in which organizations know each other's expertise - each of which means staff competence has an important part to do, as it can prevent very high risks for the company by delivering skills to employees. Work mistakes can occur if Skill for employees is ignored by the organization. The number of workers who will leave will also raise because the Organization will feel saturated and unappreciating, and because each expertise also has a different impact on its employees, the Agency needs to know what skills are necessary to apply to its employees. Quality and technical staffing expertise should also be conducted periodically. This has an effect on human resources growth as well as on the performance of employees where managers are better able to understand and be accountable to employee results of development of skills and human resources to increase employee productivity and a role in enhancing the management of qualifications and employee behavior and avoiding failures. Therefore, very helpful for individuals and organizations itself to be able to understand the complexities of the job, to understand the business growth, the goals that will be accomplished by the company, to understand the need of teamwork to conduct work and to understand easily the role of ability and human resources development in order to be able to understand the challenges of the work.

It is evident from this phenomenon that skill and human resource development significantly influence employee performance. The Cultural Patrimony Preservation Office of South Sulawesi (BPCB Sulsel) is the Ministry of Education and Cultures' Technical Implementation Agency, accountable to and responsible to the Director-General of Culture for the preservation of cultural heritage. The involvement of BPCB South Sulawesi as a Technical Implementation Unit of the Directorate General of Culture is inseparable from the efforts made during the colonial period with the establishment of an NGC to handle antiquities in Indonesia as "Commisie in Nederlandsch Indie Voor Oedheikundig Onderzoek Op Java en Madura" The commission is still temporarily pioneered in 1901 led by Branders, domiciled in Jakarta with the working areas of Java and Madura.

The South Sulawesi Cultural History Centre's office hires 100 people. The data indicate that the South Sulawesi Culture Protection Center has 8 units divided into two parts: functional and administrative. It was renamed the Architectural and Historical Sanctuary of the Provinces of South, Southeast and Central Sulawesi in 2002, and became the Makassar Architectural Conservation Centre. The Institute for Antiques was transferred until 2012 from the minister of education and cultural to the ministry of culture. In 2008 the working sector of Makassar Archaeological Heritage Preservation Center, covering the areas of South Sulawesi, Central Sulawesi and Southeast Sulawesi, changed with the establishment of the Gorontalo Archaeological Heritage Preservation Center, whose working areas include the provinces of Gorontalo, Central Sulawesi and North Sulawesi. Since then, the working area of Makassar Archaeological Heritage Preservation Center, covering South, Southeast Sulawesi and West Sulawesi.

In this study, the issue is defined in the context as follows: (1) Does the skill affect civil servants at the South Sulawesi Cultural Heritage Preservation Agency and (2) does it affect the performance of government officials at the South Sulawesi Cultural Heritage Preservation Centre? Then the object of the research: (1) analyze the effect of skills on the performance of officials in the Cultural Heritage Preservation Agency in South Sulawesi and (2) analyze the impact on public servants in the South Sulawesi Cultural Heritage Preservation Agency of the human resource creation.

There are also Research objectiveness. first, For the office of The Cultural Heritage Preservation Center of South Sulawesi, this research is expected to provide input to the Office of Cultural Heritage of South Sulawesi. To take appropriate steps in an effort to improve the performance of employees through Skill and development of human resources that are useful.
for the performance of employees of the South Sulawesi Cultural Reserve. secondly, For Researchers, this research is an opportunity for the authors to apply the theories that the authors get from the bench, deepen knowledge and add insights in the field of human resource management, especially those related to Skill and development of human resources as well as employee performance and the last For Other Parties, this research is useful as a reference material in conducting research in the future, especially research related to Skill and development of human resources as well as the performance of civil servants of the South Sulawesi Cultural Heritage Office.

The role of human resource management in the organization is not only administrative but rather more directed to how to develop the potential of human resources in order to be creative and innovative therefore by holding Skill and development in a company or agency can form more qualified human resources. So that efforts can be made to improve the performance of civil servants in the office of the Cultural Heritage Preservation Center of South Sulawesi, in how a leader is able to provide Skill in advance for his employees, with the aim of the initial process for employees in order to improve the knowledge and skills of employees or new employees, after which to develop human resources which is the second way of an organization to facilitate employees to maintain the knowledge, expertise, and / or attitude needed in handling current or future work.

In relation to the problems that have been raised previously, it can be presented hypotheses of the main problems that have been raised are as follows:

\[ H1 : \text{Skill has a positive and significant effect on the performance of civil servants of the South Sulawesi Cultural Heritage Preservation Agency office.} \]

\[ H2 : \text{Human Resource Development has a positive and significant influence on the performance of civil servants of the South Sulawesi Cultural Heritage Preservation office.} \]

**RESEARCH METHODS**

This research used quantitative method as a proposed study. When classified as such, this research is classified as explanation or clarification analysis. Therefore, explanation level research is a research explaining the role of the research variables and the correlation between the variables The study was also used as a method for data collection through questionnaires provided to respondents. The data collected were submitted as an indicator on a likert scale of 5 points, according to the list of concerns (indicators). The study used 100 workers who are working in Southern Sulawesi's cultural heritage preservation center. The study used 100 participants. Where every employee has different qualities from high school to teacher (S2) based on his or her job experience. The nature of the population in terms of sex and age is also heterogeneous. Due to the unusually large number of participants not too many can be used as questioners. As the population was the same as many researchers, this study can then be defined as population science. Multiple linear regression approaches have been used in quality and quantitative data analyzes. This approach is used when evaluating the effect on the performance.
of civilian servants at the Cultural Heritage Preservation Center South Sulawesi of skills and development of human capital. This part will be known the most dominant factors influence, at the same time to know the degree of influence of factors together. The regression equation used is:

\[ Y = a + b1X1 + b2X2 + e \]

Where:
- \( Y \) = Employee Performance
- \( X1 \) = Skill
- \( X2 \) = Human Resource Development
- \( a \) = Constants
- \( e \) = Disruptive factor
- \( b1 \) to \( b4 \) = Regression coefficient

Based on the results of calculation analysis with multiple linear regression methods that have been done, then it is necessary to conduct a series of tests to prove the hypothesis. The tests in question are F test and t test.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Data analysis is carried out using multiple linear regression with the aim of knowing the influence of education and human resource development on employee performance. Statistical Package for Social Science (SPSS) will be used to assist the process of multiple linear analysis.

Table 1. Multiple Regression Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>B</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Q</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>-.123</td>
<td>.113</td>
<td></td>
<td>-1.089</td>
<td>.279</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skill</td>
<td>.506</td>
<td>.063</td>
<td>.453</td>
<td>7.989</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Resource</td>
<td>.523</td>
<td>.055</td>
<td>.543</td>
<td>9.580</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data, 2020

Based on the table above, there is a double linear regression equation as follows: \( Y = -0.123 + 0.506X1 + 0.523X2 \)

The equation above can be explained as follows: a) The constant value of -0.123 indicates that if the independent variable is zero then the resulting employee performance is - 0.123, b) The value of 0.506 in the Skill variable (X1) is of positive value so it can be said that the higher the Skill, the higher the employee performance will be. The regression coefficient of 0.506 states that each addition of 1 Skill will increase employee performance by 0.506 units. So that the Skill is positively related to employee performance, assuming other independent variables are considered constant and c) The value of 0.523 in hr development variables (X2) is of positive value so it can be said that the higher the human resources development, the higher the employee performance. The regression coefficient of 0.523 states that each addition of 1 human resources development will increase employee performance by 0.523 units. So that human resource development is positively related to employee performance, assuming other independent variables are considered constant.

Furthermore, T (Partial) Test is carried out to find out the effect of each indicator of free variables on bound variables. The t-test is performed by comparing between t-count and t-table. To determine the value of t-table, it is determined by a significant level of 5% with the degree of freedom df = (n-k-1) where n is the number of respondents and k is the number of indicators / variables.
Table 2. Multiple Regression Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Q</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>-0.123</td>
<td>0.113</td>
<td>-1.089</td>
<td>.279</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skill</td>
<td>0.506</td>
<td>0.063</td>
<td>0.453</td>
<td>7.989</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Resource Development</td>
<td>0.523</td>
<td>0.055</td>
<td>0.543</td>
<td>9.580</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data, 2020

Based on the table above for t calculate Skill of 7,989 and for table t value of n=k-1 result (n=respondent, k=independent variable) of 1,660. Thus based on the calculated t value of 7,989>1,660 and for the probability value of 0.00<0.05 it can be concluded that H0 is rejected and Ha is accepted, thus the Skill has a partial significant effect on employee performance.

Based on the table above to t calculate human resource development of 9,580 and for table t value of n=k-1 result (n=respondent, k=independent variable) of 1,660. Thus based on the calculated t value of 9,580>1,660 and for the probability value of 0.01<0.05, it can be concluded that H0 is rejected and Ha is accepted, thus human resource development has a partial significant effect on employee performance.

Next test F (Simultaneous), to test whether independent variables simultaneously have a significant effect on dependent variables. Where F calculates > F table, then the hypothesis is accepted or together free variables can explain the bound variables simultaneously. Conversely if F calculates < F table, then H0 accepted or together free variables have no influence on bound variables. To know whether or not significant the influence of free variables on bound variables together is used probability of 5% (α = 0.05).

Table 3. F (Simultaneous) Test

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Regression</td>
<td>20.970</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10.485</td>
<td>863.833</td>
<td>.000b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residual</td>
<td>1.177</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>.012</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>22.148</td>
<td>99</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data, 2020

With a significant rate of 5% and degrees of freedom df1 = 2 and df2 = 97 then f table obtained (2:97) = 3.09. Based on the anova test or F test of the SPSS output, it appears that obtained f calculates 863.833 >3.09 f value of the table and probability of 0.000 < 0.05. More precisely, the value of F calculates compared to F table where if F calculate > F table then simultaneously independent variables have a positive and significant effect on dependent variables.

Furthermore coefficients of determination are used in detecting how far the relationship and the ability of the model in explaining dependent variables. In the processed data there are four independent variables, as in the following table.
Table 4. Coefficient of Determination

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R Square</th>
<th>Adjusted R Square</th>
<th>Std. Error of the Estimate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.973a</td>
<td>.947</td>
<td>.946</td>
<td>.110</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data, 2020

In the table above, it can be seen that R obtained a correlation value of $R = 0.973$ which means that the correlation or relationship between Skill and human resources development has an influence on employee performance by 97.3%. Then the coefficient value of determination or $R$ Square is $= 0.947$ which means that 94.7% of employee performance influence is influenced by Skill and human resource development.

**Discussion**

**The Effect of Skill on Employee Performance**

In the results of respondents' responses to Skill variables obtained the average respondent gave an agreed and strongly agreed answer. Although there are some who give less agreeable, disagreeing answers, and snagat disagree. Indicators that have the highest average value is the seventh indicator that is after Skill, employees are able to complete the work easily and quickly. This proves that indeed by providing Skill to employees has a huge impact on employee performance. By providing Skill, employees better understand their field of work and they no longer make mistakes in working so that their work can be completed quickly.

The indicators that have the lowest average values are the second and fourth indicators. The second indicator is that the instructor mastered the Skill material so that it was able to explain the material well with an average score of 4.19. This proves that the instructor who provided the Skill at the South Sulawesi Cultural Heritage Preservation Agency office did not understand the material and could not explain the material properly. It is recommended that the South Sulawesi Cultural Heritage Preservation Agency replace the instructors who are better than the previous instructors.

The fourth indicator is that employees have a high enthusiasm in attending Skill also has the lowest average value of 4.19. This proves that there are some employees who still have minimal enthusiasm to participate in the Skill held by the South Sulawesi Cultural Heritage Preservation Center. For them, their enthusiasm is less due to the skill material provided, the employees have followed in the previous skill so as to make the employees enthusiastic less to follow the coach.

However, from the hypothetical test results obtained t calculate Skill of 7,989 and for the table t value of n-k-1 result (n= respondent, k = independent variable) of 1,660. Thus based on the calculated t value of 7,989>1,660 and for the probability value of 0.00< 0.05 it can be concluded that H0 is rejected and Ha is accepted, thus the Skill has a partial significant effect on employee performance.

Skill is in principle an effort to equip a person with knowledge and skills and attitude so that a person has the ability to carry out daily organizational tasks or activities. Thus, through the knowledge and skills and attitude gained through the Skill, an employee or member of the organization can be more confident in facing the problems faced in his/her duties. Thus, Skill is an effort to develop or explore the abilities owned by a person so that they have skills, ways of thinking and improvement of attitudes in accordance with the needs of a company or certain institutions to be able to solve problems that may be faced in the future. The results of this study are in line with research conducted by Donny Triasmoko (2014) which also examined employee performance problems. Donny obtained the results that Skill can affect an employee's performance.

**The Effect of Human Resource Development on Employee Performance**
The results show that the average respondent gave an agreed and strongly agreed answer. Although there are some who give less agreeable, disagreeing answers, and snagat disagree. The indicator that has the highest average value is the first indicator that the position of employees has been in accordance with their educational background with an average score of 4.19. This proves that employees can work well because their educational background is in accordance with the current position. It should be for employees if they want to work to the maximum, they should have an educational background that is in line with their current position. Although there are some karyawna who have a background that is not in accordance with their field, the office provides development to the pegawia in order to work properly.

The indicator that has the lowest average value is the sixth indicator, namely the placement of pegawia in a work environment in accordance with its physical and psychological abilities with an average value of 4.15. This proves that there are some employees who have weak physical and psychological abilities if placed in a fairly complicated work environment. Because each employee has different physical and psychological abilities so the office needs to develop.

However, the hypothetical test results obtained t calculate human resource development of 9,580 and for the table t value of n-k-1 result (n=respondent, k=independent variable) of 1,660. Thus based on the calculated t value of 9,580 >1,660 and for the probability value of 0.01 < 0.05, it can be concluded that H0 is rejected and Ha is accepted, thus human resource development has a partial significant effect on employee performance. Basically development is a learning opportunity designed to help workers or human resources of an institution. Investment in human resources development, is an expenditure shown to improve the productive capacity of human beings. To face the demands of the task now and especially to answer the challenges of the future, good human resources development, the agency will have a competitive power that is more effective and able to positively in national and global competition.

HR Development focuses more on the general needs of long-term agencies. The results are indirect and DNA can only be measured in the long run. Development also helps employees to prepare for changes in their work that can be caused by new technologies and job design. The results of this research also provide the same research that conducted by Rizky Nugraha (2019) which also examined employee performance problems. Rizky Nugraha obtained the results that human resource development has an influence on the performance of morowali inspectorate employees.

**The Effect of Skill and Human Resources Development on Employee Performance**

In the results of respondents' responses to employee performance variables obtained the average respondent gave an agreed and strongly agreed answer. Although there are some who give less agreeable, disagreeing answers, and snagat disagree. The indicators that have the highest average values are the first and sixth indicators. For the first indicator is in completing the work employees always prioritize the quality of work with an average value of 4.26. This proves that pegawia in South Sulawesi Cultural Heritage Preservation Center has a good performance because they sellau prioritize the quality of work.

For the sixth indicator, employees feel guilty if the job is too late to finish with an average of 4.26. This proves that employees at the South Sulawesi Cultural Heritage Preservation Center always try to work well and the work is always done on time. If they are late in completing work, there is remorse and guilt in the employee.

As for indicators that have the lowest average value, namely the second and fourth indicators. For the second indicator, employees do a job with full calculation, careful and thorough. This proves that there are some employees who still work not carefully and thoroughly. Especially for employees who have just worked at the Cultural Heritage Preservation Center of South Sulawesi sometimes still make some mistakes in working. This is
still understandable because the pegawia is still newly joined so it requires Skill and development.

The fourth indicator is that in completing the work employees always take the initiative without waiting for orders from superiors also have the lowest average value. This proves that there are some employees who still need to be instructed in advance to do the job. They don't know what to do so later the boss who gives their new direction works. Employees do not yet have their own initiatives about what to do. So that employees need Skill and development in order to improve their performance.

However, from the hypothetical test results obtained with a significant rate of 5% and degrees of freedom df1 = 2 and df2 = 97 then f table obtained (2:97) = 3.09. Based on the anova test or F test of the SPSS output, it appears that obtained f calculates 863.833 > 3.09 f value of the table and probability of 0.000 < 0.05. More precisely, the value of F calculates compared to F table where if F calculates > F table then simultaneously independent variables have a positive and significant effect on dependent variables. If an employee is given Skill and development, the employee will automatically perform well because he/she has received Skill and development. The coefficient value of determination or R Square is = 0.947 which means that 94.7% of employee performance influence is influenced by Skill and human resource development.

CONCLUSION
The Skill had a positive and significant effect on the performance of Civil Servants at the Cultural Heritage Preservation Center of South Sulawesi, human resource development had a positive and significant effect on the performance of Civil Servants at the South Sulawesi Cultural Heritage Preservation Center and the Skill and development of human resources had a positive and significant effect on the performance of Civil Servants at the South Sulawesi Cultural Heritage Preservation Center.

Based on the results of research that Skill and development of human resources have a positive and significant effect on the performance of employees, the Office of the Cultural Heritage Preservation Center of South Sulawesi should routinely provide Skill to its employees and pay more attention to the performance of its employees. If there are employees who are considered to be under-performing, it is best to develop themselves and this research only uses dependent and independent variables. Therefore, it is expected that the researchers will be able to research using variables other than dependent and independent variables, such as moderating or intervening variables, to obtain better results related to employee performance. Further researchers can also add more samples to make the research results more valid. In addition, researchers can then research using private employee samples because in this study took samples specifically for civil servants.

REFERENCE
Yogyakarta: Student Library.